# COLLEGIALITY IN ACTION

#### Effective Participation Fundamentals





# Introductions and Context

- David Morse, Past-President ASCCC
- Larry Galizio, PhD, President, Community College League of California
- In every college, situations raise issues regarding the respective roles of key players in governance.
- We are here primarily to address the relationships among the academic senate, administrators, and the board of trustees but also to discuss how these groups work constructively with students, classified staff, and faculty unions to assure collegial governance of the institution.





#### The California Community College System

■When did we begin?

■Where did we begin?

■What is our mission?





# A Little Bit of History—The CCC Mission

- **1907** "Public Junior Colleges" established in California to teach the first two years of university study for high school graduates.
- 1960
  Donahoe Act/Master Plan sets primary missions of the junior colleges as transfer courses, vocational and technical study leading to employment, and general or liberal arts courses; and authorizes remedial instruction, ESL, adult noncredit, & community service courses.

■Name changed to "community colleges" and community services added to the mission.



ACADEMIC SENATE for CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGE



# A Little Bit of History—The CCC Mission

*1988* 

- ■AB 1725 (Vasconcellos) sets the following mission priorities:
  - Lower Division Arts and Sciences
  - Vocational and Occupational Fields
  - Remedial Instruction
  - Adult Noncredit Education
  - Community Service Courses and Programs





# AB1725: Redefining Our System

#### • What did AB 1725 do?

- Funding system changed
- Mission priorities set
- Established faculty qualifications, tenure periods, evaluation processes
- Set goal of 75% full-time faculty
- Funding for professional development
- Diversity goals set
- Delineated governance and decision-making





# AB1725: Redefining Our System

- What was the intent of AB 1725?
  - Enhance community college image
  - Increase support for more money
  - Move from K-12 to higher education
  - Develop more unified system
  - Institutional renewal





# A Bit More History—The CCC Mission

**2017** Board of Governors approves the Vision for Success

#### 2020

Board of Governors elects its first African American president and elects a female president and vice president together for the first time



ACADEMIC SENATE or CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES



#### Governance in the California Community Colleges

- What is participatory governance?
- What is shared governance?
- What is the difference?





#### Participatory Governance

- " ... not a simple process to implement goodwill, thoughtful people, a willingness to take risks and the ability to admit problems exist – can go far toward establishing a positive environment...
- The central objective should be creation of a climate where energy is devoted to solving crucial educational tasks and not to turf battles over governance."
  - CCCT/CEOCCC Policy Paper, December 1989





#### Scenario #1

 The overall governance structure of the college includes a "college council" with representatives from administration, the academic senate, the faculty union, the classified union, the classified senate, and the associated student organization. This council meets with the college president on a monthly basis. In order to promote greater overall collegiality, the college president announces that all newly developed or revised board policies or administrative procedures will now require the approval of the college council before they can be forwarded to the governing board. The academic senate protests that this requirement is not consistent with the definitions of collegial consultation with the senate under Title 5 regulations.





#### Questions To Ask

- What is the issue?
- Is there legal language or other documentation that should be cited?
- What is the process that should be followed? If it wasn't followed, what suggestions do you have for making sure that the correct process is followed?





#### Answers to Scenario #1

- The Issue: the academic senate's role in governance and right to direct consultation with the board's designee regarding academic and professional matters.
- Citation: Title 5 §53203(a) states that local governing boards "shall provide that the governing board or its designees will consult collegially with the academic senate when adopting policies and procedures on academic and professional matters." The definition of collegial consultation in Title 5 §53203(d) indicates that the board will either primarily rely on the senate's recommendations or reach mutual agreement with the senate.
- Both options for collegial consultation under Title 5 require direct communication between the senate and the governing board or its representatives.
- Process: While a college council may serve various positive purposes, decisions regarding academic and professional matters must, according to Title 5, be primarily based on consultation with the academic senate, not on equal voices for all constituencies. The academic senate president should point out the specific language of Title 5 regarding the definition of collegial consultation to the college president and if necessary to the governing board. The senate should then work with the college president to establish a process to ensure that recommendations on policy and procedures regarding academic and professional matters are based on consultation with the senate and are not prevented from being presented to the board by any other college constituency.
- Recommendations involving academic and professional matters may be presented to the college council for input and dialogue as a part of that process, but the final decision on forwarding the recommendations to the board must depend on consultation with the senate and not on approval from an overall college council.





#### Answers to Scenario #1

 Suggestion: The college might develop separate processes for consideration of policy and procedures that require collegial consultation with the academic senate and for those that do not.
 Policy and procedures that do not require direct consultation with the senate may be submitted for consideration and approval by a college council if the president and the board so decide. Those that do require collegial consultation with the senate may appropriately be brought to the college council for input and discussion but not for approval that would prevent submission to the board.





# Title 5 Terminology: Effective Participation

•Participating effectively in district and college governance is shared involvement in the decision-making process.

- It does not imply total agreement;
- The same level of involvement by all is not required; and
- Final decisions rest with the board.





# Benefits and Values of Our Governance System

- Expertise and analytical skills of many
- Understanding of objective/decisions
- Commitment to implementation
- Leadership opportunities
- Promotion of trust and cooperation
- Opportunities for conflict resolution
- Less dissent





# Challenges of Our Governance System

- Participation by individuals with limited expertise
- Time away from other duties
- Can require considerable time for decision
- Shared accountability
- Differing expectations and understanding
- Potential conflict if board/designee rejects recommendation





#### The Law—Education Code

•Board of Governors shall establish "minimum standards" and local governing boards shall "establish procedures not inconsistent" with those standards to ensure the following:

- Faculty, staff and students the right to participate effectively in district and college governance
- The right of academic senates to assume primary responsibility for making recommendations in the areas of curriculum and academic standards.

•Education Code Sections 70901 and 70902





# Regulation: Academic Senate Role

- (a) The governing board shall adopt policies for appropriate delegation of authority and responsibility to its academic senate.
- ...providing at a minimum the governing board or its designees consult collegially with the academic senate when adopting policies and procedures on academic and professional matters. (*Title 5 § 53203*)
- "Consult collegially" means
- 1. Relying primarily upon the advice and judgment of the academic senate; or
- 2. Reaching mutual agreement between the governing board/designee and representatives of the academic senate.
   (*Title 5 § 53200*)





# Questions on Collegial Consultation

■Who decides which of the two processes in the regulations, "rely primarily" or "mutual agreement," should be used on a given issue?

Must a local board select only one procedure for addressing all ten of the identified academic and professional matters, or can there be a different approach used for the different matters?





- (d)(1) Governing board action: Rely Primarily
  - recommendations of the senate will normally be accepted
  - only in exceptional circumstances and for compelling reasons will the recommendations not be accepted
  - If not accepted, board/designee communicate its reasons in writing, if requested

*Title 5 §53200* 





- Title 5 §53200(d)(2) Governing board action: Mutual Agreement
  - If agreement not reached, existing policy remains in effect unless
    - exposure to legal liability
    - or substantial fiscal hardship.
  - If no policy or existing policy creates exposure to legal liability or substantial fiscal hardship
    - board may act if agreement not reached
    - if good faith effort first
    - only for compelling legal, fiscal, or organizational reasons



ACADEMIC SENATE for CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES



Academic and professional matters means the following policy development and implementation matters:

- 1. Degree and certificate requirements
- 2. Curriculum, including establishing prerequisites and placing courses within disciplines
- 3. Grading policies
- 4. Educational program development
- 5. Standards or policies regarding student preparation and success

*Title 5 §53200* 





Academic and professional matters means the following policy development and implementation matters:

- 6. District and college governance structures, as related to faculty roles
- 7. Faculty roles and involvement in accreditation processes, including self-study and annual reports
- 8. Policies for faculty professional development activities
- 9. Processes for program review

10. Processes for institutional planning and budget development, and...





Academic and professional matters means the following policy development and implementation matters:

"Plus one":

Other academic and professional matters as mutually agreed upon between the governing board and the academic senate.





# What Are the FHDA Board Policies Where the Academic Senate is "Rely Primarily"?

AREA 1. Curriculum	JOINT DEVELOPMENT	PRIMARY RELIANCE	х
<ol> <li>Degree and Certificate requirements:</li> <li>General Ed. and Program Specific</li> <li>Units for degree</li> </ol>			х
3. Grading policies	Х		Х
4. Educational Program Development	Х		
5. Standards regarding student preparation and success			х
<ol><li>Governance structures as related to facult roles</li></ol>	y X		
7. Faculty involvement in accreditation	Х		
8. Policies for faculty professional development activities other than contractua aspects	I		х
9. Policies for Program Review	Х		
10. Processes for institutional planning and budget development	Х		

11. Other Academic and Professional Issues

Whether primary reliance or joint development to be determined on an individual basis by the Board or its designee.





## Legal Provisions Related to Academic Senates

- Equivalencies to Minimum Qualifications: Process, criteria and standards agreed upon jointly by board designee and academic senate
  - Ed Code *§*87359
- Faculty Hiring: Criteria, policies and procedures shall be agreed upon jointly by board designee and academic senate
  - Ed Code *§*87360
- Administrator Retreat Rights: Process agreed upon jointly; board to rely primarily upon the advice and judgment of the academic senate to determine that the administrator possesses minimum qualifications for employment as a faculty member
  - Ed Code **§**87458





#### Legal Provisions Related to Academic Senates

- Curriculum Committee: Established by mutual agreement of administration and academic senate
- Appointments to College Bodies: The appointment of faculty members to serve on college or district committees, task forces, or other groups dealing with academic and professional matters, shall be made, after consultation with the chief executive officer or his or her designee, by the academic senate. Notwithstanding this subsection, the collective bargaining representative may seek to appoint faculty members to committees, task forces, or other groups.
  - Title 5 **§** 53203 (f)

• Title 5 § 55002





#### Legal Provisions Related to Faculty

#### Collective Bargaining

- Decision-making policies and implementation cannot detract from negotiated agreements on wages and working conditions
- Academic senate and bargaining representatives may establish agreements as to consulting, collaborating, sharing or delegating (*Title 5 §53204*)
- In those districts where the following are collectively bargained, the exclusive bargaining agent shall consult with the academic senate prior to engaging in bargaining on: Faculty Evaluation (Ed Code §87663), Tenure (Ed Code §87610.6) and Faculty Service Areas (*Ed Code §87743.2*)





# Staff Roles in College Governance

Governing boards adopt policies and procedures that provide staff opportunity to participate effectively in district and college governance.

- formulation and development of policies and procedures, and
- processes for jointly developing recommendations that have or will have a significant effect on staff.

Board shall not take action on matters significantly affecting staff until the recommendations and opinions of staff are given every reasonable consideration.

•Title 5 **§**51023.5





#### Student Roles in College Governance

Governing boards adopt policies and procedures that provide students opportunity to participate effectively in district and college governance on formulation and development of policies and procedures and processes for jointly developing recommendations that have or will have a significant effect on students.

Board shall not take action on a matter having a significant effect on students until recommendations and positions by students are given every reasonable consideration.

*Title 5 §51023.7* 





# **Regulation: Students**

- Polices and procedure that have a "significant effect on students" include :
  - (1) grading polices
  - (2) codes of student conduct
  - (3) academic disciplinary policies
  - (4) curriculum development
  - (5) courses or programs which should be initiated or discontinued
  - (6) processes for institutional planning and budget development
  - (7) standards and polices regarding student preparation and success
  - (8) student services planning and development
  - (9) student fees within the authority of the district to adopt

(10) any other district and college policy, procedure or related matter that the district governing board determines will have a significant effect on students

Title 5 **§**51023.7





#### Important Notes on Collegial Consultation

■The Board has the final say

■The Board is never prohibited from acting

"Exceptional circumstances" and "compelling reasons" vs. "compelling legal, fiscal, or organizational reasons"





#### Scenario #2

 As the college engages in the implementation of a new guided pathways framework, the college president announces the formation of an administrative task force that will oversee the development of the framework. The academic senate president approaches the college president and asks that faculty be included with equal representation on the task force, as many of the aspects of guided pathways involve academic and professional matters, and that collegial consultation should take place before reaching any decision involving academic and professional matters. The college president responds that consultation with the academic senate on academic and professional matters is required only at the policy level and that since the task force will not be developing new formal policies, consultation is not a requirement.





#### Questions to Ask

- What is the issue?
- Is there legal language or other documentation that should be cited?
- What is the process that should be followed? If it wasn't followed, what suggestions do you have for making sure that the correct process is followed?





#### Answers (Scenario #2)

- Issue: The issue is the level and circumstances for which collegial consultation on academic and professional matters is required, especially but not limited to initiatives mandated by the legislature or promoted by the CCC Chancellor's Office.
- Citation: Title 5 §53203(a) states, "The governing board of a community college district . . . shall provide that the governing board or its designees will consult collegially with the academic senate when adopting policies and procedures on academic and professional matters. This requirement to consult collegially shall not limit other rights and responsibilities of the academic senate which are specifically provided in statute or other Board of Governors regulations." The language in this section specifically identifies both "policies and procedures." Indeed, while the list of academic and professional matters in Title 5 §53200 specifies the requirement for consultation at the policy level in certain cases—such as "standards or policies regarding student preparation and success" and "policies for faculty professional development activities"—in other cases it specifically references processes—such as "processes for institutional planning and budget development"—and in still others makes no specific reference to the level of consultation and appears to refer to the topic as a whole—such as "curriculum, including establishing prerequisites and placing courses within disciplines." Furthermore, the concluding language in §53203(a) explicitly does not place limitations on consultation with the academic senate. Often the context of the issue at hand will determine whether an issue is an academic and professional matter and the point at which consultation should take place. Both administration and faculty must work in good faith to establish reasonable processes that allow the administration to make operational decisions while fully respecting the faculty voice and the academic senate's right to collegial consultation.





#### Answers (Scenario #2)

- Process: While the implementation of an initiative such as guided pathways may impact formal board policy, consultation with the academic senate on academic and professional matters is not limited to the level of policy development. While some aspects of the implementation may indeed be purely organizational and may not be subject to consultation, the development of a framework for any such initiative clearly impacts college planning and may touch on the processes for other academic and professional matters such as budgeting, processes to promote student success, and curriculum, among others. The academic senate president should again approach the college president, cite the specific language of Title 5 that does not limit consultation with the senate to formal policy development, and request that the senate be included in the development and membership of task force that will engage in planning the guided pathways framework.
- Suggestion: While consultation with the academic senate in the planning of an initiative like guided pathways or the Student Equity and Achievement Program is mandatory, the success of any such college-wide initiative requires the involvement and dedication of other college constituencies as well. Rather than developing a plan on its own, administration is generally better served by greater inclusion of and transparency to all constituent groups, even when such inclusion is not required.





#### Scenario #3

 The dean of the college's admissions and records area is interested in establishing a new process for evaluating and approving student transfer credit from other institutions. The dean discusses this issue with the college's student success committee, with several faculty department chairs who regularly evaluate transfer credit, and with a group of interested counselors and develops a new set of specifications and criteria that all departments will be required to follow in evaluating and approving transfer credit. The academic senate protests that collegial consultation processes were not followed in developing these specifications. The dean responds that the student success committee, the department chairs, and the counselors involved had input and therefore faculty were sufficiently consulted.





#### Questions to Ask

- What is the issue?
- Is there legal language or other documentation that should be cited?
- What is the process that should be followed? If it wasn't followed, what suggestions do you have for making sure that the correct process is followed?





## Answers (Scenario #3)

- The issue: The definition of and requirements for consultation with the academic senate on behalf of faculty.
- Citation: Title 5 §53200(c) lists "standards or policies regarding student preparation and success" as an academic and professional matter. Evaluation and acceptance of transfer credit involves standards for student success and also touches on the integrity of curriculum, which is another area listed under the same Title 5 section.
- Furthermore, Title 5 §53203(a) states that local governing boards "shall provide that the governing board or its designees will consult collegially with the academic senate when adopting policies and procedures on academic and professional matters." Importantly, the language in this Title 5 section mandates consultation with the academic senate, not simply with faculty.
- Process: Discussion with a committee or with individual faculty, even with those elected to faculty leadership positions like department chairs, is not sufficient to fulfill the requirements of collegial consultation under Title 5. The academic senate can delegate the consultation process to other faculty such as committees or department chairs, but the choice to do so rests with the senate and cannot be forced on the senate. The dean should suspend the new process and engage in appropriate consultation with the academic senate. Until such consultation occurs, no changes to existing policy or processes should be implemented.





#### Answers (Scenario #3)

 Suggestion: New administrators often make mistakes such as the one described in this scenario through misunderstanding of requirements rather than intent to circumvent processes. Local academic senates should work with administrative leadership to ensure that new administrators are educated on Title 5 requirements regarding collegial consultation.



#### Scenario #4

• The college has for several years had two separate groups that oversee and coordinate professional development, one for faculty and another for classified staff and administration. The new Vice President of Human Resources sees this structure as inefficient, noting that many professional development activities are equally relevant to all constituent groups. The new vice president therefore announces the intention of combining the two committees under the leadership of a classified administrator who will be responsible for overseeing all professional development at the college. The academic senate objects to this plan, stating that faculty professional development falls under the senate's purview and that it must therefore be considered and overseen only by faculty separately from other professional development efforts at the college.





#### Questions to Ask

- What is the issue?
- Is there legal language or other documentation that should be cited?
- What is the process that should be followed? If it wasn't followed, what suggestions do you have for making sure that the correct process is followed?





#### Answers (Scenario #4)

- Issue: The issue is the academic senate's role in oversight of faculty professional development.
- Citation: Title 5 §53200(c)(8) lists "Policies for faculty professional development activities" as an academic and professional matter. The structure of oversight for professional development is an issue at the policy level and therefore falls under academic senate purview. Title 5 §53203(d) provides the definitions that apply to collegial consultation on academic and professional matters and indicates that districts must either rely primarily on recommendations of the academic senate or must reach mutual agreement with the senate. The definitions further indicate that, even in extreme or compelling circumstances, changes to policy or procedure cannot be implemented until a good faith effort at such consultation with the academic senate has taken place.
- Process: Title 5 places "policies for faculty professional development activities" as an academic and professional matter under academic senate purview; it does not indicate that all faculty professional development must be directly overseen and coordinated by the academic senate or by faculty. In this scenario, the vice president should consult with the academic senate, explain the reasons for wishing to combine the committees, and work to reach agreement on an acceptable structure. The academic senate should ensure that faculty retain an appropriate voice in oversight and development of faculty professional development, but such a voice does not preclude a joint effort with other constituencies. No change should be made to the existing structure until such agreement is reached.



ACADEMIC SENATE for CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES



#### Answers (Scenario #4)

 Suggestion: Various structures could exist to achieve an effective overall professional development committee, including a faculty cochair for the committee and a separate process for approval of activities specific to faculty professional development that allows for greater faculty control. A cooperative structure might be developed to the benefit of all college constituencies while still preserving the academic senate's voice in matters specific to faculty professional development.





LAW	REGULATIONS LEVEL OF PARTICIPATION	REGULATIONS AREAS OF PARTICIPATION	REGULATIONS CONSIDERATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS
FACULTY			
*Right to participate effectively	*Local boards shall:	*Academic and professional matters	*Consult collegially
*Academic Senate right to assume primary responsibility for recommending on: •Curriculum •Academic standards	•Consult collegially on •Academic and professional matters	<ul> <li>1.Curriculum</li> <li>2.Degree</li> <li>3.Grading</li> <li>4.Program development</li> <li>5.Student standards</li> <li>6.Faculty role in governance structures</li> <li>7.Accreditation</li> <li>8.Professional development</li> <li>9.Processes for program review</li> <li>10.Processes for planning &amp; budget</li> <li>11.Other</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Reach mutual agreement</li> <li>Rely primarily on advice and judgment of academic senate</li> </ul>
STAFF			
*Right to participate effectively	<ul> <li>*Provided opportunity to participate in formulation of:</li> <li>•Policies,</li> <li>•Procedures, and</li> <li>•Processes that have a</li> <li>•Significant effect on staff.</li> </ul>	*Significant effect on staff	*Given "every reasonable consideration"
STUDENTS			
*Right to participate effectively	<ul> <li>*Provided opportunity to participate in formulation of</li> <li>Policies,</li> <li>Procedures and</li> <li>Processes that have a</li> <li>Significant effect on students.</li> </ul>	*Significant effect on students 1.Grading 2.Codes of conduct 3.Academic discipline 4.Curriculum development 5.Program creation and discontinuance 6.Processes for budget & planning 7.Student preparation and success 8.Student services planning & development 9.Fees 10.Other	*Given "every reasonable consideration"





#### Thank You

#### David Morse

Professor of English, Long Beach CityCollege At-Large Representative, FACCC Board of Governors President, Academic Senate for California Community Colleges 2014-2016

> **Larry Galizio** President

Community College League of California https://www.ccleague.org



