### **MEETING MINUTES**

Date: May 1, 2020 Time: 11-1 p.m. Loc: Zoom

#### **NOTES BY TOPIC**

ITEM	TOPIC	DISCUSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
1	Introduction/Agenda Approval of Minutes	<ul> <li>Approve last meeting minutes: Issac Escoto moves to approve, Itzel Sanchez seconds</li> </ul>	Approved		
2	Student's Report	Student's not present to give report			
3	President's Report	<ul> <li>Thank you to Advisory Council for having this meeting; special meeting in light of our conversation last week.</li> <li>Not doing usual report but use this opportunity to open up the conversation. You all probably received the governance memo. Ability to come together in a time of crisis; be empathetic. To support our students. These are trying times, want to stay focused on the today we (Chancellor's and Board) have to prepare for the tomorrow.</li> <li>With Chancellor's permission I will be reading her prior</li> </ul>	Tri-Chairs and R&R will meet with President Nguyen to come up with next steps.	Tri-Charis meet separately and we draft a memo based on what we heard today; maybe meet with the Tri-chairs of the R&R council to see how this can be handled moving forward	

## GOVERNANCE | COUNCIL

## GOVERNANCE | COUNCIL

ITEM	TOPIC	DISCUSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
		extended, unemployment claims rising 19%; we don't have definite numbers yet  • Elias: Concur with Bret, we have entered a recession; impact is immediate; Los Rios put a hold on 95% of their positions; Sierra College also implemented a hold  • Micaela: Holding LRC Dean position; what is the plan for the management of tutoring and the library and STEM?  • Amy Edwards: LRC position as well as the AVPI the other positions don't have as much impact on folks; we all understand that there is going to be a crisis the concern is our ability to be part of the discussions at the get go prior to decisions being made; distrust with district directive and what the college claimed the directed them to do  • Thuy: budget situation results in us being very careful and to review positions on a case by case basis; for classified positions their work requires physical presence and we virtual in the summer and most likely in the fall; placing positions on hold for now is not the finality			

# FOOTE GOVE

### **♦** FOOTHILL COLLEGE

## GOVERNANCE | COUNCIL

When can we start lifting these holds? Look forward to the recommendations, etc.  Two administrator positions; appreciate faculty fighting for these administrator positions. Shared pain; admin team said they would share the pain as well during the previous cuts  Why these two positions? They were in the requisition queue for the Chancellors Cabinet  The Dean's role was not set out to be a physical role primarily  If you think these positions should not be put on hold we can do that, just know it will come with a cost  It's holds for now and gives the college an opportunity to assess  Ram: LRC and AVPI position are really important; will experience a huge surge in enrollment in the coming quarters; we need all hands-on deck to manage enrollment; passionate about AVPI position for that reason  Amber: Aside from budgetary concerns what other criteria went into deciding these positions?  Thus, Hiring holds are there to	When can we start lifting these		
give us time, room and flexibility.  But if you feel we can use holds in other places, we can work	recommendations, etc.  Two administrator positions; appreciate faculty fighting for these administrator positions. Shared pain; admin team said they would share the pain as well during the previous cuts  Why these two positions? They were in the requisition queue for the Chancellors Cabinet  The Dean's role was not set out to be a physical role primarily  If you think these positions should not be put on hold we can do that, just know it will come with a cost  It's holds for now and gives the college an opportunity to assess  Ram: LRC and AVPI position are really important; will experience a huge surge in enrollment in the coming quarters; we need all hands-on deck to manage enrollment; passionate about AVPI position for that reason  Amber: Aside from budgetary concerns what other criteria went into deciding these positions?  Thuy: Hiring holds are there to give us time, room and flexibility. But if you feel we can use holds		

## • I G

### **♦** FOOTHILL COLLEGE

## GOVERNANCE | COUNCIL

with that. Buying time to make decisions holistically.  Sara Cooper: we want to be part of the decision-making process from the get go Isaac Escoto: we feel like decisions keep being made without the stakeholders at the table Sara Cooper: I'm on the R&R council and we didn't hear any of this information or there was no discussion at that council about whether we should put hiring holds or freezes; the whole campus wants to be a part of that discussion and the frustration comes when these decisions are made without consulting anybody else on campus; there were no faculty involved in these discussions, none of the councils were involved, what we are asking is to be a partner in these decisions; in order to be a partner we need to be able to see the data even if it's not concrete, and we want to be able to hear your rationale and then we want to be able to hear your rationale and then we want to be able to the see the data even if it's not concrete, and we want to be able to hear your rationale and then we want to be able to hear your rationale and	decisions holistically.  Sara Cooper: we want to be part of the decision-making process from the get go  Isaac Escoto: we feel like decisions keep being made without the stakeholders at the table  Sara Cooper: I'm on the R&R council and we didn't hear any of this information or there was no discussion at that council about whether we should put hiring holds or freezes; the whole campus wants to be a part of that discussion and the frustration comes when these decisions are made without consulting anybody else on campus; there were no faculty involved in these discussions, none of the councils were involved, what we are asking is to be a partner in these decisions; in order to be a partner we need to be able to see the data even if it's not concrete, and we want to be able to hear your rationale and then we want to be part of the conversation and making	ITEM	TOPIC	DISCUSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
decisions about holds, freezes, program elimination, budgets,		ITEM	TOPIC	with that. Buying time to make decisions holistically.  Sara Cooper: we want to be part of the decision-making process from the get go  Isaac Escoto: we feel like decisions keep being made without the stakeholders at the table  Sara Cooper: I'm on the R&R council and we didn't hear any of this information or there was no discussion at that council about whether we should put hiring holds or freezes; the whole campus wants to be a part of that discussion and the frustration comes when these decisions are made without consulting anybody else on campus; there were no faculty involved in these discussions, none of the councils were involved, what we are asking is to be a partner in these decisions; in order to be a partner we need to be able to see the data even if it's not concrete, and we want to be able to hear your rationale and then we want to be part of the conversation and making decisions about holds, freezes, program elimination, budgets, etc.; it's frustrating because	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP

# **♥** FC GC

### **♦** FOOTHILL COLLEGE

## GOVERNANCE | COUNCIL

ITEM   TOPIC   DISCUSSION   OUTCOME   NEXT STEPS	*RESP
faculty now sitting on multiple committees and multiple councils waiting to be a part of the conversation and decisions keep getting made in a way that the decision is made and then we go through this meeting where we sit and listen to the rationale and we are all a little angry that we weren't a part of the decision and people are frustrated at this pattern; it would've been more effective to come to governance and discuss the budget situation and positions that could potentially be put on hold and coming up with a decision together, right now we are told what positions were put on hold and now we need to consider what the consequences of those are, that seems short cited  It would have been really helpful to discuss this with the folks who are in tutoring, in the library, or with the folks that are going to be affected by the AVPI position and it doesn't feel like that happened  Big picture regarding a process in place; coming to R&R and having these discussions seems appropriate  Conversations need to be had before the decisions are made;	resp

## 

ITEM	TOPIC	DISCUSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
		so that the people who have			
		spent countless hours especially			
		in the last couple of months			
		ensuring this college keeps			
		running feel like they have a			
		say, because they don't right			
		now			
		<ul> <li>Isaac: There's 127 people on</li> </ul>			
		this meeting because we feel			
		like decisions keep getting made			
		without consulting us before			
		hand; this is why Academic			
		Senate chose to write a formal			
		letter to formally request the			
		campus please stop making			
		these decisions prior to involving			
		the stakeholders; thank you			
		Thuy for asking for our opinion			
		now; but we ask you to please			
		stop making these decisions			
		before consulting us, people are			
		finding out about the decisions			
		being made at Advisory Council			
		meetings; letter asks that you			
		consider a faculty presence on			
		the President's Cabinet because			
		decisions are made and then			
		you realize faculty were not			
		involved; we don't want to feel			
		blindsided; please stop making			
		decisions without involving the			
		stakeholders			
		<ul> <li>Katherine Maurer: Thuy, this is</li> </ul>			
		the perfect example that our			
		system is not working; receiving			
		these informed comments in a			

## GOVERNANCE | COUNCIL

ITEM	TOPIC	DISCUSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
		10 minute Q&A President's Report; this is not the mechanism in which this should be happening. We need to figure out a way to make this work, because the system is clearly broken.  • It is very concerning that you are potentially reversing the holds based on an impassioned plea at this point; that hearing from folks in this mechanism has made you sway your decision; if you made a decision based off of data, etc., it shouldn't be changed because people are pleading for it.  • Confused with the district relationship with our budget  • Preston Ni: Reason why so many people have logged on today is because of the impending situation of the state budget as well as the concern with the decision making process of the college; we need to address the decision making process before we talk about specific issues and concerns; dealing with two issues, internal and external; if we address the internal problem first as a process in the spirit of shared governance we can deal with any external threats collaboratively	OUTCOME	NEAT STEPS	nesr

## 

ITEM	TOPIC	DISCUSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
		Pawel: library is overlooked			
		when decisions are made; again			
		when a decision is going to be			
		made, involve the stakeholders;			
		transparency is not there; AVPI			
		what criteria is being used to fill			
		this position, we already have			
		someone in the interim position			
		and it seems like this person is			
		constantly being overlooked;			
		what qualifications are being			
		looked at for a successful			
		candidate because I feel we			
		already have that person			
		<ul> <li>Thuy: I hope the Advisory</li> </ul>			
		Council would start talking about			
		the actual recommendations for			
		processes and the holds, want			
		to follow up with what faculty is			
		saying, this is an opportunity;			
		hiring holds are meant to slow			
		down the process to allow us			
		time to make decisions, it's a			
		hold for now, not an elimination			
		of the position, other colleges			
		are placing hiring freezes; the			
		point of hiring holds for now			
		means we didn't have the data			
		or information to make an			
		informed decision; we are			
		norming with each other; these			
		decisions are burdensome;			
		might require Advisory Council			
		to meet more frequently,			
		especially in these times			
		because there are deadlines			

# FOOTHILL COLLEGE GOVERNANCE | COUNCIL

ITEM	TOPIC	DISCUSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
ITEM	TOPIC	that need to be met; faculty hires will move forward; AVPI position is at its finality to clarify  • Amy Edwards: most of us don't feel like the questions we have brought up are being answered by Thuy in this meeting; questions are being evaded; key here is that the stakeholders are not being consulted; you are not owning the decision; Judy said colleges made the decision; there is a feeling of distrust; stakeholders need to be approached if this is a shared governance before a decision is being made; why are the people who are drastically affected by this not being spoken to before decisions are handed down administratively  • Thuy: as a member of the Chancellor's cabinet; we try to reach an agreement between all of us; conversation agreement; we can sparse about whether who's decision it is; the answer is we don't know what the ramifications are, we are using a tool that buys our college time by placing a hold for now until we have more clarity; this is our opportunity, I want to do right by you	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
		Tri-Chairs: Anthony: we need to look at the process, consult			

## GOVERNANCE | COUNCIL

ITEM	TOPIC DISCU	JSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
ITEM	TOPIC DISCL	R&R when these decisions are being made; would like to know what is going to happen with the Interim roles Mike: agree with everything that's been said Isaac: the outcome is not the issue, it's how we get to the outcome; what process should we follow; we are being asked to make a recommendation on the holds, however, we don't have that information at the moment to make an informed decision; our cultural norm is using our governance council; we want to share that load in decision making Thuy: this is part of the challenge of administration is many times we have to make decisions when we don't have all the information, having to be comfortable of operating in the unknown, that is why we are having holds for now until we know, there was no science on the holds; this is why it's challenging; with the unknown, what would you like to do at this point Isaac: everyone knows that there is unknown; people want to be involved in preparing for the unknown, being in a place	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP

## GOVERNANCE | COUNCIL

stakeholders when preparing for the unknown  • Eric Reed: R&R would be happy to schedule meeting to discuss this, would like to see the date and be involved in the decision making  • Thuy: would R&R discuss the different scenarios so that recommendations are offered to the President in that context  • Kathy: If we had been consulted	the unknown  Eric Reed: R&R would be happy to schedule meeting to discuss this, would like to see the date and be involved in the decision making  Thuy: would R&R discuss the different scenarios so that recommendations are offered to the President in that context  Kathy: If we had been consulted before any announcement was made maybe even arrived at the same decision; don't know what I want to do right now because many times we are given the decision and then you realize we wanted you to ask so you do but you give us such a strict timeline; I need to process what I've heard today; another issue is that the councils meet once a month, I know what we have isn't working; speaking for	ITEM TOPIC	DISCUSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP	
made maybe even arrived at the same decision; don't know what I want to do right now because many times we are given the decision and then you realize we wanted you to ask so you do but you give us such a strict timeline; I need to process what I've heard today; another issue is that the councils meet once a month, I know what we have isn't working; speaking for myself personally, Thuy if you want to make this decision, then make it and own it, if you want our recommendation then ask  Thuy: the pandemic has taken out of order the budgeting process; nervous moving forward and taking on such	want to make this decision, then make it and own it, if you want our recommendation then ask  Thuy: the pandemic has taken out of order the budgeting process; nervous moving forward and taking on such decision points because people	ITEM TOPIC	stakeholders when preparing for the unknown  Eric Reed: R&R would be happy to schedule meeting to discuss this, would like to see the date and be involved in the decision making  Thuy: would R&R discuss the different scenarios so that recommendations are offered to the President in that context  Kathy: If we had been consulted before any announcement was made maybe even arrived at the same decision; don't know what I want to do right now because many times we are given the decision and then you realize we wanted you to ask so you do but you give us such a strict timeline; I need to process what I've heard today; another issue is that the councils meet once a month, I know what we have isn't working; speaking for myself personally, Thuy if you want to make this decision, then make it and own it, if you want our recommendation then ask  Thuy: the pandemic has taken out of order the budgeting process; nervous moving forward and taking on such	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP	

ITEM	TOPIC	DISCUSSION	OUTCOME	NEXT STEPS	*RESP
		Denise: Agree with Kathy; this is incredibly frustrating, define what administrators do and what shared governance is for; R&R sometimes it is hard for us to make a recommendation because we don't have all the data to make informed decisions			
4	Preparing for Potential Future Financial Uncertainty	Did not address this agenda item.			
5	Review meeting norms Public comments	Did not address this agenda item.			

<sup>\*</sup>Include the person(s) and or group responsible for next steps.

#### MEMBERS PRESENT

#### **Voting**

Tri-Chairs: Isaac Escoto, Mike Mohebbi, Anthony Cervantes

Administrator: Betsy Nikolchev

Classified Staff: Itzel Sanchez Zarraga, Danmin Deng

Faculty: Amy Edwards, Preston Ni

Students:

#### Non-Voting

Ex-Officio: Thuy Nguyen, Bret Watson, Elias Regalado

Recorder: Veronica Casas Facilitator: Simon Pennington