

# Rubric Comprehensive Program Review 2023

## Instructional Discipline Template

### A. Program Information

#### Narrative Criteria

##### The Program Mission Statement

- clearly states the purpose of the program
- indicates the primary function
- indicates the activities of the program
- describes the programs' aspirational goals for the future and what the program hopes to achieve
- reflects the program's priorities and values
- indicates who the students and/or stakeholders are
- is aligned to the college mission statement
- is clear and concise

- Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

##### Feedback

This is a strong mission statement: We have questions about the word "superior". We wonder if this could be more equitable and approachable to new students in the field of faculty.

The mission of the Photography department is to provide superior instruction in the use of photographic techniques for vocational, general education and transfer students. A photography major will provide the student with a strong foundation in aesthetic principles as well as an extensive range of practical photographic techniques needed for college transfer, entry into the photographic workplace or for artistic expression. Course work includes digital photography, color photography, studio lighting, experimental processes, photo criticism and portfolio preparation. Students are encouraged to develop a personal, expressive style, achieve technical excellence and examine photography's role in society

### B. Enrollment Trends

#### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

#### Narrative Criteria

##### The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

- Data  
 Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

- Narrative  
 Meets Expectations  
 Needs Improvement

##### Feedback

In this section, more attention and specifics on ways to build enrollment since there is a 20 percent decrease in the program. The WSCH has a 15% decrease in enrollment as well as a -13% for FTES. The amount of sections is consistent from 2018-20.

Why was there a decrease in enrollment during the time that shows the data? Now there is an intention to focus on building course offerings to follow guided pathways and on campus. Why is making more on campus the solution?

## C. Enrollment by Student Demographics

### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Data

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

### Feedback

There is success for equal amounts of male and female enrollment there could be more improvement in building more enrollment for headcounts for race/ethnicity in the photography programs. The headcount is split around 30% Asian, Latinx and White students.

When reviewing the need statement from section C, we would need more information on what this may mean.

You may want to say the enrollment trends for ethnicity are aligned with the overall enrollment trends of the college. This would make more sense when you are saying the statement below.

"We will focus on student success as distribution is not an area of concern".

## D. Overall Student Course Success

Click the link below to view the program's Course Success by Modality data

[https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f/g/personal/10771097\\_fhda\\_edu/EvAWIA883IZEvnoRGBXt4RkBzT8NbCHSRANRq3TVkHj\\_TA?e=LjaKXc](https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f/g/personal/10771097_fhda_edu/EvAWIA883IZEvnoRGBXt4RkBzT8NbCHSRANRq3TVkHj_TA?e=LjaKXc)

### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Data

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Feedback

There are high success rates for both the fully online asynchronous and hybrid course offerings. In the narrative portion, there is not a clear connection between the data and the statements. It would also help to specifically discuss that the success rates for Black, Latinx, Filipinx, Asian, Native American, Pacific Islander, and White students have been consistent from 2018-2023.

As readers, we would need additional information on how the POCR courses are helping course success. Is there any data that can support this claim?

### E. Disproportionate Impact

Click the link below to view the program's Disproportionate Impact data

[https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f/g/personal/10771097\\_fhda\\_edu/EvAWIA883IZEvnoRGBXt4RkBzT8NbCHSRANRq3TVkHj\\_TA?e=LjaKXc](https://foothilldeanza-my.sharepoint.com/:f/g/personal/10771097_fhda_edu/EvAWIA883IZEvnoRGBXt4RkBzT8NbCHSRANRq3TVkHj_TA?e=LjaKXc)

#### Data Criteria

- The data shows that the program is making progress towards accomplishing their goals (The data is in alignment with the program's goals).

#### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Data

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Feedback

[object Object]

### F. Regular and Substantive Interaction

#### Narrative Criteria

The narrative response...

- aligns with data

- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program
- has measurable outcomes

Narrative

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Feedback

The list meets expectations. It is a great accomplishment that the photo faculty has gone through POCR. The readers may not have experience with POCR and might need more information about the OEI rubric and the area that discusses RSI.

## G. Summative Evaluation

Overall, the Comprehensive Program Review

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

Feedback

We noticed one solution the photo program suggested would be non-credit courses and certificates to improve the declining enrollment. We are interested in hearing if there are any other solutions you may be exploring.

---

This form is completed and ready for acceptance.



## Career and Technical Education Programs Rubric 2023

### A. Re-Accreditation Information

#### 2. Did the program maintain accreditation?

- The program was reaccredited and received commendations or citations or recommendations - Meets Expectations
- The program was put on probation - Needs Improvement

#### 5. What actions has the program taken to address the accreditation citations/recommendations? What barriers has the program faced in implementing improvements?

Did the program make the required improvements?

- The program was able to take actions and received the needed support to take the actions - Meets Expectations
- The program was not able to take actions to improve because it did not get the support needed from the college - Needs Some Improvement
- The program had the needed support to take actions but did not act or is limited in direction from the accreditor to take actions - Needs Major Improvement
- Not Applicable (The program did not receive recommendations)

#### Feedback

The Photo Department CTE said they did not go through accreditation. They wrote this is not applicable.

### B. Advisory Board

#### 1. Did the program hold an annual advisory board meeting each year of the five-year cycle?

#### 2. Did the program submit the advisory board meeting minutes each year of the five-year cycle?

#### 3. Did the program include the web address/link to the online minutes?

- Yes the program held an annual meeting of the advisory board and submitted the minutes - Meets Expectations
- No, the program did not hold an annual meeting of the advisory board and/or did not submit the minutes - Needs Improvement

#### 4. Were there any advisory board commendations/special mentions identified?

- The program received commendations - Meets Expectations
- Not Applicable

#### 5. Are there any identified actions for improvement or recommendations based on feedback from the program's advisory board?

#### 6. What actions has the program taken to address recommendations made by the Advisory Board? What barriers has the program faced in implementing improvements?

- The program was able to take actions or investigate the recommendations and received the needed support to proceed - Meets Expectations
- The program was not able to take actions or investigate because it did not get the support needed - Needs Some Improvement
- The program had the needed support to take actions but did not act or is limited in direction from the advisory board to take actions - Needs Major Improvement
- Not Applicable (The program did not receive recommendations)

#### Feedback

The photo department provided plans for non-credit and received favorable support. They are responding to the actions for improvement:

Based on Advisory Board discussions and recommendations, we continued the development of the new certificates and have gotten statewide permission for both the credit and non-credit certificates.

Areas for improvement would be to write comments based on the control of the program. Staffing faculty is not under the control of the program. This is what was said:

"Looking at the past five years, some of the barriers to implementation have been the pandemic, the retirement of one faculty, and the promotion of another to dean. The work of implementing many of the suggestions during most of the past five years has fallen on one faculty member."

## C. Regional Labor Demand

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/cte-labor-demand-data-2023-24.pdf>

### 1. In the data table above, what does the regional labor demand data trend indicate?

- Labor demand has an upward trend or is projected to be flat - Meets Expectations
- Labor demand is projected to decrease - Needs Improvement

### 2. Describe the regional demand for labor in this sector. If the projected data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in labor demand, explain why.

#### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
  - is informed by data
  - is within the control of the program
- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

#### Feedback

This chart does not show all of the options for photography workers. Our Labor Market Information report for Digital Photography Occupations for June 2022 shows a need for Digital Photography Workers. "Based on all available data, there appears to be an "undersupply" of Digital Photography workers compared to the demand for this cluster of occupations in the Bay region and in the Silicon Valley sub-region (Santa Clara county). There is a projected annual gap of about 681 students in the Bay region and 146 students in the Silicon Valley Sub-Region." LMI\_Foothill\_Digital Photography\_June 2022.docx There is also a significant need for creativity in workers in other sectors, which studies in photography and media can fill and prepare students to thrive

## D. Regional Labor Supply

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/cte-labor-supply-data-2023-24.pdf>

### 1. In the data table above, what does the regional labor supply data trend indicate?

- Labor supply has a downward trend or is projected to be flat - Meets Expectations
- Labor supply is projected to increase - Needs Improvement

### 2. Describe the regional supply for labor in this sector over the last five years. If the data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in labor supply, explain why.

#### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
  - is informed by data
  - is within the control of the program
- Meets Expectations



## Feedback

If possible explain more what you mean by "The Regional Labor Supply has gone down. "

## E. Regional Wages

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/cte-regional-wage-data-2023-24.pdf>

### 1. In the data table above, what does the wage data trend indicate?

- The occupational wage trend increased or stayed flat - Meets Expectations
- The occupational wage trend decreased - Needs Improvement

### 2. Describe the regional trend for wages in this sector over the last five years. If the data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in wages, explain why.

#### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
  - is informed by data
  - is within the control of the program
- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

## Feedback

You state that "The need for Digital Photography workers from our Labor market report support this data," but there needs to be a clear explanation as to why the slight increase occurred.

## F. Program 13.5 Course Completion

Program 13.5 Course Completion					
Unduplicated Headcount	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22
<b>Child Development</b>	99	72	86	102	92
<b>Dental Hygiene</b>	47	97	99	119	114
<b>Emergency Medical Services</b>	100	96	82	52	41
<b>Horticulture</b>	50	57	44	44	26
<b>Photography</b>	0	0	0	0	1
<b>Radiologic Technology</b>	42	44	42	42	47

CTE courses offered between 2017-18 and 2021-22 that were used to retrieve completion counts include the following:  
 Child Development: CHLD 1, 2, 8, 50A, 50D, 51A, 54ABD, 56, 56N, 59, 63N, 71-74, 80ABC, 82, 86AB, 88, 88B, 89, 90BC, 91, 95, 53NC, 53NP.  
 Dental Hygiene: DH 50, 70R, 200L, 300AB, 302, 304, 305ABCD, 308, 310, 312, 314, 316AB, 318, 320ABCD, 322, 324, 326ABC, 328ABC, 330, 332, 350ABC, 352, 354, 356.  
 Emergency Medical Services: EMS 50, 52, 52A, 53, 53A, 60AB, 61AB, 62AB, 63AB, 64AB, 203.  
 Horticulture: HORT10, 15, 21-26, 30, 31, 40, 45, 52CEGH, 54ABCJKL, 55A, 60BCDFJ, 80ABCDI, 90CDGHIMPQSUVWXYZ, 91AC  
 Photography: PHOT 4ABC, 11, 11H, 72, 74AB.  
 Radiologic Technology: RT 50, 51ABC, 52D, 53, 53ABCD, 54ABC, 55ABC, 61AB, 62ABC, 63, 63ABC, 64, 65, 70AB, 72, 74, 75, 200L, 53AL, 53BL, 53CL.

### 1. In the data table above, what does the data trend indicate about the number of students completing the 13.5 CTE units each year in the last five years within your program?

- The number of students completing 13.5 units increased over the 5 year period or stayed flat over the 5 year period - Meets Expectations
- The number of students completing 13.5 units decreased over the 5 year period - Needs Improvement

### 2. If the data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease in the number of students completing the 13.5 CTE units, explain why.

#### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

## Feedback

Since submitting the program review, the Photography department met with members of the Institutional Research team for clarification on the data. IR reviewed the data on the back end and confirmed that although the list of CTE courses listed in the note section was not accurate, all CTE courses were properly coded as CTE and were included in the data that was pulled. It was also noted, that although the 13.5 CTE unit benchmark might be typical for allied health students it is not necessarily typical for photography students and that is OK.

The photo department identified the need for Guided Pathways to help students complete the CTE courses.

## G. Program Graduate Employment Rates

Click the link below to view program data.

<https://foothill.edu/programreview/prg-rev-docs/cte-graduate-employment-rates-2023-24.pdf>

**1. In the data table above, what does the graduate employment rate indicate for certificate/degree completers (e.g., Within one year after Community College Completion)?**

- Employment rate is between 100% and 80% - Meets Expectations
- Employment rate is less than 80% - Needs Improvement

**2. Describe the graduate employment rate trend for both certificates and degrees. If the projected data trend shows no change/flat, an increase, or decrease, explain why.**

### Narrative Criteria

- aligns with data
- is informed by data
- is within the control of the program

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

## Feedback

There is a need for improvement but the department faculty hope the stackable certificates with non-credit will help increase the completion of degrees and certificates.

## H. Summative Evaluation

Overall, the Career & Technical Education Addendum

- Meets Expectations
- Needs Improvement

## Feedback

Overall the photo department faculty are hopeful the stackable CTE non-credit certificates and classes will improve in 2023-24. They received actionable changes from the advisory board. The goal would be



to continue to work with the current faculty and work under the control of the department. The hopes for a new hired faculty will not be under the control for the faculty.

This form is completed and ready for acceptance.