Instructional Program Review Template Evaluation Rubric

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Mission Statement	**Criteria** The mission statement 1. clearly states the purpose of the program 2. indicates the primary function 3. Indicates the activities of the program 4. describes the programs' aspirational goals for the future and what the program hopes to achieve 5. reflects the program's priorities and values 6. indicates who the students and/or stakeholders are 7. is aligned to the college mission statement 8. is clear and concise **Definitions** The program mission statement is a concise statement of the general values and principles which guide the curriculum. It sets a tone and a philosophical position from which follow a program's goals and objectives. The program mission statement should define the broad purposes the program is aiming to achieve, describe the community the program is designed to serve, and state the values and guiding principles which define its standards. The mission statement is a public declaration that community colleges use to describe their founding purpose and major organizational commitments (i.e., what they do and why they do it). It may describe a school's day-to-day operational objectives, its instructional values, or its public commitments to its students and community. Define Distinctive - (https://www.edglossary.org/mission-and-vision/; https://assessment.uconn.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/1804/2016/06/HowToWriteMission.pdf; also based on material from the UCF Academic Program Assessment Handbook and material from the University of San Diego)	Exceeds expectations for all 8 criteria	Addresses all 8 criteria	Addresses 4 to 7 of the criteria	Addresses fewer than 4 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Program Learning Outcomes (PLO)	• **Measurable Learning Outcomes** - All PLOs are stated in terms of measurable knowledge, skills, or behaviors • **PLO statements reflect levels of learning** - All PLOs show evidence of building towards higher order thinking skills • **Student-Centered** - All learning outcomes should focus on the student • **Uses language that is easily understood by students** - PLO statements are clear and easily understood by the student • **PLOs are Actionable** - the PLOs can be used for program improvement **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** PLOs encompass what students should be able to know, think, or do across all courses within a curriculum; course student learning outcomes are more specific and describe achievement expected in a particular course. **Measurable Learning Outcomes** • PLOs are often too broad to be measurable or too narrow to be of much use for program improvement. • Avoid using verbs that are vague or cannot be objectively assessed **PLO statements reflect levels of learning** • Depending on the course and program goals, PLOs may target a range of skills or cognitive processes. Bloom's (1956) taxonomy of educational objectives differentiates between three domains of learning: cognitive, affective, and psychomotor. **Student-Centered** • Effective PLOs will explain expectations for student behavior, performance, or understanding • A common misapplication of objectives is for the teacher/presenter to state what he/she is going to do (e.g., "My plan this morning is to talk about…"), rather than what the student is expected to be able to do (e.g., "After this session, you should be able to…").	Exceeds expectations for all 5 criteria	Addresses all 5 criteria	Addresses 3 to 4 of the criteria	Addresses 2 or fewer of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
	Uses language that is easily understood by students • Uses language that is easily understood by students in clear language while avoiding jargon • For instance, students in an entry-level of classes within their program need to have a clear idea of what they will get out of the classes that make up their certificate or degree (e.g., by the end of the program) • Learning objectives tell students what is important. • PLOs should be used to assess their learning progress as they work through the courses within their certificate or degree **PLOs are Actionable** • PLOs that are actionable will provide departments with feedback and help to understand how to better facilitate student learning across the course within a degree or certificate • Actionable PLOs help instructors within the program practice good course design. **PLOs should align with the ILOs** • https://foothill.edu/staff/irs/LOA/ILOS.php (https://web.uri.edu/assessment/course-level-outcomes/; https://academicprograms.calpoly.edu/program-learning-outcomes; http://ccoe.rbhs.rutgers.edu/forms/pdf/EffectiveUseofLearningObjectives.pdf; https://learninginnovation.duke.edu/blog/2017/03/learning-objectives/)				

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
FTES - Enrollment Trends	**What does the FTES data trend indicate?**	FTES has improved over the time span	The FTES has decreased over the time span no more than 10%	FTES has decreased over the time span by 10% to 30%	FTES has decreased over the time span by greater than 30%
FTES – Narrative Explanation	**Discuss the factors that would help the college understand these trends and whether there are tangible reasons for the increase or decrease.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control 4. Explained in the context of the size of the program (i.e., number of students, number of sections) **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • The curriculum and course materials are current • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 3 of the criteria
FTES – Action Narrative (if needed)	**Describe the proposed actions for stabilizing/increasing the FTES.** **Narrative Criteria** Proposed actions in the narrative demonstrates… 1. Actions are informed by data 2. Actions are within department control 3. Actions are demonstrable (what are the deliverables) 4. Outcomes are measurable 5. Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 4 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Sections – Narrative	**Explain why the number of sections increased or decreased.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control 4. Explained in the context of the size of the program (i.e., number of students, seat counts) **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • Increase in FTEF • Changes in accreditation requirements or labor market trends • Degree/certificates requirements • Changes in state policy	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 3 of the criteria
Sections – Narrative Explanation	**Explain why the number of sections increased while FTES decreased.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reasons for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • Increase in FTEF • Changes in accreditation requirements or labor market trends • Degree/certificates requirements • Changes in state policy	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Productivity - Enrollment Trends	**What does the data indicate about the productivity trend?**	The program productivity trend has increased	The program productivity is flat	The program productivity has not decrease by more than 5%	The program productivity has decreased by more than 5%

Productivity – Narrative Explanation	**Explain why the productivity increased or decreased.**
	
	Narrative Criteria
	Narrative demonstrates…
	1. An understanding of the trend
	2. Reasons for the trend(s) are provided
	3. Reasons include items within department control
	
	Definitions, Examples and Explanations
	Narrative reasons could reflect:
	• Scheduling –
	  o Courses in the program are scheduled for efficiency
	  o Sequenced to allow for program completion
	  o Is student driven (e.g., when most students want to take class)
	• Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery
	• Enrollment data from day one to census
		The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria

Productivity – Action Narrative (if needed)	**Describe the proposed actions for stabilizing/increasing the productivity number.** **Narrative Criteria** Proposed actions in the narrative demonstrates… 1. Actions are informed by data 2. Actions are within department control 3. Actions are demonstrable 4. Outcomes are measurable 5. Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 4 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Enrollment By Gender/Sex	**Does your program differ in the percentage of males to females, in this most recent year, compared to the College?** Enrollment by gender/sex is consistent with the College: 52% Female/ 48% Male	The difference between the genders/sex is less than or equal 10%	The difference between the gender/sex is between 11% to 20%	The difference between the gender/sex is between 21% to 30%	The difference between the gender/sex is greater than 30%
Enrollment By Gender/Sex – Narrative Explanation	**If the data trend shows a change in male or female enrollment, explain why there was a change.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria
Enrollment by Gender– Action Narrative (if needed)	**What is the source of gender disparity and what proposed/planned actions is the program taking to achieve parity?** **Narrative Criteria** Proposed actions in the narrative demonstrates… 1. Actions are informed by data 2. Actions are within department control 3. Actions are demonstrable 4. Outcomes are measurable 5. Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 4 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Enrollment Distribution by Declared Majors in the Program	**What does the data trend indicate about enrollment (headcount) by gender of declared majors in the program?** Gender Gap in Enrollment Distribution by Declared Majors	The Gender gap by declared major is between 0% and 10%	The Gender gap by declared major is between 11% and 20%	The Gender gap by declared major is Between 21% and 30%	The Gender gap by declared major is greater than 30%

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Meets the Standard		Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	
Enrollment by Ethnicity Trend	**What do the data trends indicate about program enrollment by ethnicity? Can we confirm?** Enrollment Distribution by Ethnicity is Consistent with the College: 5% African American | 30% Asian | 5% Filipinx | 26% Latinx | 0% Native American | 1% Pacific Islander | 29% White| 4% Decline to State	The enrollment mirrors the college's ethnic distribution		The enrollment does not mirror the college's ethnic distribution	

Enrollment by Ethnicity Trend	**Explain changes identified over the past five years for each ethnic group (address each ethnic group by bullet point).**
	
	Narrative Criteria
	Narrative demonstrates…
	  1. An understanding of the trend
	  2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided
	  3. Reasons include items within department control
		The narrative exceeds	The narrative includes all 3 of	The narrative includes 2 of	The narrative includes

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
	Definitions, Examples and Explanations Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices	expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	the criteria	the criteria	fewer than 2 of the criteria
Enrollment by ethnicity – Action Narrative (if needed)	**Describe the proposed actions for addressing disparities in enrollment by ethnic group within the program.** **Narrative Criteria** Proposed actions in the narrative demonstrates… 1. Actions are informed by data 2. Actions are within department control 3. Actions are demonstrable 4. Outcomes are measurable 5. Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical) **Definitions, Examples, and Explanations** Narrative proposed actions could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 4 of the criteria
Student Course Success Rate (All Students)	**What does the data trend indicate about overall course success?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over	Course success has decreased over the time span	Course success has decreased over the time

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
			the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	by no more than 4 percentage points	span by more than 4 percentage points
Student Course Success Rate – Narrative Explanation	**If the data trend shows an increase, decrease, or no change in students' course success percentage, explain what programmatic factors led to such a trend.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices	The narrative Exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria
Student Course Success Rate – Action Narrative (if needed)	**Describe the proposed actions for stabilizing/increasing the student's course success percentages.** **Narrative Criteria** Proposed actions in the narrative demonstrates… 1. Actions are informed by data 2. Actions are within department control 3. Actions are demonstrable 4. Outcomes are measurable 5. Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical)	The narrative Exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 4 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
	Definitions, Examples, and Explanations Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices				
Student Course Success Rate Gap- (Targeted and Non-Targeted)	**Is there a course success gap between African-American, Latinx, Filipinx student groups and Asian, Native American, Pacific Islander, White, Decline to State student groups?**	There is no gap between the two groups	The gap between the two groups has decreased over the time span	The gap between the two groups has not changed over the time span	The gap between the two groups has increased over the time span
Student Course Success Rate Gap (Targeted and Non-Targeted) – Narrative Explanation	**Explain why the course success gap increased or decreased.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Student Course Success Rate Gap (Targeted and Non-Targeted) – Action Narrative (if needed)	**What actions are program faculty and staff engaged in to decrease the course success gap between African-American, Latinx, and Filipinx student groups and Asian, Native American, Pacific Islander, White, and Decline to State student groups?** **Narrative Criteria** Proposed actions in the narrative demonstrates… 1. Actions are informed by data 2. Actions are within department control 3. Actions are demonstrable 4. Outcomes are measurable 5. Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical) **Definitions, Examples, and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives Hiring Practices	The narrative Exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 4 of the criteria
Female Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by gender?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Male Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by gender?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points
Gender Student Course Success Rates – Narrative Explanation	**If the data trend shows an increase or decrease in the male or female student course success percentages, explain why the percentage increased or decreased for both.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria
Gender Student Course Success Rates	**Describe proposed actions to stabilize/increase the course success rates for either male or female.** **Narrative Criteria** Proposed actions in the narrative demonstrates… 1. Actions are informed by data 2. Actions are within department control	The narrative Exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 4 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
– Action Narrative	3. Actions are demonstrable 4. Outcomes are measurable 5. Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical) **Definitions, Examples, and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices				
African American Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by ethnicity?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points
Asian Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by ethnicity?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Filipinx Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by ethnicity?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points
Latinx Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by ethnicity?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points
Native American Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by ethnicity?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points
Pacific Islander Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by ethnicity?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
White Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by ethnicity?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points
Decline to State Student Course Success Rates	**What does the data trend indicate about course success by ethnicity?**	Course success has improved over the time span	Course success has been flat or decreased over the time span by no more than 2 percentage point	Course success has decreased over the time span by no more than 4 percentage points	Course success has decreased over the time span by more than 4 percentage points
Student Course Success Rates by Ethnicity – Narrative Explanation (if needed)	**If the data trend shows a decrease in any of the student ethnic groups' course success rates, explain why the percentage decreased for each (address each ethnic group by bullet point).** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices	The narrative Exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Student Course Success Rates by Ethnicity – Narrative Explanation (if needed)	**Describe the reasons for the gap in course success.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices	The narrative Exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria
Student Course Success Rates by Ethnicity – Action Narrative (if needed)	**Describe the proposed actions for stabilizing/improving the course success by ethnicity.** **Narrative Criteria** Proposed actions in the narrative demonstrates… 1. Actions are informed by data 2. Actions are within department control 3. Actions are demonstrable 4. Outcomes are measurable 5. Possible to accomplish including short term, as well as long term (e.g., aspirational and practical) **Definitions, Examples, and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 5 of the criteria	The narrative includes 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 4 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
	• Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices				

Career and Technical Education Program Review Template Evaluation Rubric

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Re-Accreditation	**Did the program maintain accreditation?**	The program was reaccredited, received commendations, and no citations/recommendations	The program was reaccredited and received both commendations and citations/recommendations	The program was re-accredited and has several citations (recommendations for improvement)	The program was put on probation

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Meets the Standard		Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Re-Accreditation	**What were the major citations of the last re-accreditation report (e.g. areas of improvement, strategic direction, facilities, personnel, etc.)?** Did the program make the required improvements?	The program was able to take actions to improve and received the needed support to take the actions		The program was not able to take actions to improve because it did not get the support needed from the college	The Program had the needed support to take actions but did not act or is limited in direction from the accreditor to take actions

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Meets the Standard	Needs Improvement to Meet the Standard
Advisory Board	1. **Did the program hold an annual advisory board meeting each year of the five-year cycle?** 2. **Did the program submit the advisory board meeting minutes each year of the five-year cycle?** 3. **Did the program include the web address/link to the online minutes?**	Yes, the program held an annual meeting of the advisory board and submitted the minutes	No, the program did not hold an annual meeting of the advisory board and/or did not submit the minutes

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Advisory Board	**Did the program receive commendations from the Advisory Board**	The program received commendations	N/A		
	1. **Are there any identified actions for improvement or recommendations based on feedback from the program's advisory board?** 2. **What actions has the program taken to address recommendations made by the Advisory Board? What barriers has the program faced in implementing improvements?** Did the program act on or investigate the recommendations made by the Advisory Board?	The program was able to take actions or investigate the recommendations and received the needed support to proceed.	The program was not able to take actions or investigate because it did not get the support needed	The Program had the needed support to take actions but did not act or is limited in direction from the advisory board to take actions	
Regional Labor Demand	**In the data table above, what does the regional labor demand data trend indicate?**	Labor demand has an upward trend	Labor demand is projected to be flat	Labor demand is projected to decrease.	

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Regional Labor Demand	**Describe the regional demand for labor in this sector. If the projected data trend shows an increase or decrease in labor demand, explain why.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. An understanding of the occupation(s) **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Shows an awareness of changes in the industry/occupation • Shows an awareness of legislative policy changes • New growth in the sector • Changes in demographics such as birth rates, new residents	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Improvement to Meet the Standard	
Regional Labor Supply	**In the data table above, what does the regional labor supply data trend indicate?**	Labor supply has a downward trend	Labor supply is projected to be flat	Labor supply is projected to increase	

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Regional Labor Supply	**Describe the regional supply for labor in this sector over the last five years. If the data trend shows an increase or decrease in supply, explain why labor supply increased or decreased or showed no change.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. An understanding of the regional output/supply **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Shows an awareness of the educational system in the region • Shows an awareness of legislative policy changes • Changes in occupation wages • Changes in demographics such as new residents	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Improvement to Meet the Standard	
Regional Wages	**In the data table above, what does the wage data trend indicate?**	The occupational wage trend increased	The occupational wage stayed flat	The occupational wage trend decreased	

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Regional Wages	**Describe the regional trend for wages in this sector over the last five years. If the data trend shows an increase or decrease in wages, explain why the regional wages increased, decrease or showed no change.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. An understanding of the occupational trends **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Shows an awareness of legislative policy changes • Demand/supply for the workers in the occupation • Changes in the scope of practice and occupational responsibilities • Changes in technology	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Improvement to Meet the Standard
Program 13.5 Course Completion	**In the data table above, what does the data trend indicate about the number of students completing the 13.5 CTE units each year in the last five years within your program?**	The number of students completing 13.5 units increased over the 5-year period	The number of students completing 13.5 units stayed flat over the 5-year period	The number of students completing 13.5 units decreased over the 5-year period

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Program 13.5 Course Completion	**If the data trend shows an increase or decrease, explain why the number of students increased or decreased in completing the 13.5 CTE units.** **Narrative Criteria** Narrative demonstrates… • An understanding of the trend • Reason for the trend(s) are provided • Reasons include items within department control **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • Scheduling • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • CTE labor market data • Industry trends • Outreach Initiatives • Hiring Practices	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes 2 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 2 of the criteria
Graduate Employment Rates	**What does the graduate employment rate for degrees indicate?**	Employment rate is 100% to 90%	Employment rate is 89% to 80%	Employment rate is 79% to 70%	Employment rate is less than 69%

Template Items	Evaluation Criteria and Description	Excellent	Meets the Standard	Needs Some Improvement to Meet the Standard	Needs Major Improvement to Meet the Standard
Graduate Employment Rates	**In the data table above, what does the graduate employment rate indicate for certificate/degree completers (e.g., Within one year after Community College Completion)?**	Employment rate is 100% to 90%	Employment rate is 89% to 80%	Employment rate is 79% to 70%	Employment rate is less than 69%
	Narrative Criteria Narrative demonstrates… 1. An understanding of the trend 2. Reason for the trend(s) are provided 3. Reasons include items within department control 4. An understanding of the industry and student support services for employment **Definitions, Examples and Explanations** Narrative reasons could reflect: • Culturally and occupationally relevant pedagogy and/or curriculum • The curriculum and course materials are current • Instructional modality of the program course(s) delivery • Good relationships with industry partners • Understanding of hiring rates within the occupation • Knowledge of job postings and hiring rate • Understanding of student support services • Understanding of the soft skills needed within the occupation	The narrative exceeds expectations – the narrative could be used as an exemplar	The narrative includes all 4 of the criteria	The narrative includes 3 of the criteria	The narrative includes fewer than 3 of the criteria